



CITY OF OAKLAND
Mayor's Commission on Persons with Disabilities (MCPD)
Monday, June 19, 2017

Amended Minutes

- I. Call to Order: 5:39pm
- II. Roll Call
 - Five Commissioners present: Gregory, Harrington, Sperling, Young, Zisser
- III. Public Comments: None
- IV. Commissioner's Announcements
 - Commissioner Zisser announced that the Police Commission application period closes June 30. He encouraged people present and others to apply to ensure representation of the disability community. Selection panel is every Wednesday at 5:30pm at City Hall until August 8. When he joined the MCPD two years ago, there were four officer involved shootings of persons in mental health crisis.
 - Chair Sperling would like to agendize the Police Commission for next meeting.
- V. Chair Report; *Frank Sperling*,
 - Announced the pending appointment of a new commissioner, Daryl Meshack. Mayor nominated him and it is on City Council agenda for Tuesday, June 20 for approval.
 - Break at 5:51p.m.

- Quorum achieved at 6:08 p.m., upon arrival of Commissioner Van Docto, and Chair Sperling reconvened meeting

VI. Approval of May 2017 Minutes (**Exhibit A**)

- Commissioner Harrington requested the minutes reflect that reallocation of funds would not delay the Transition Plan.
- Motion to approve May 2017 minutes: Commissioner Harrington
Seconded by Commissioner Gregory
Aye: 6 – Gregory, Harrington, Sperling, Van Docto, Young, Zisser
Motion passed.

VII. Agenda Modification and Approval

- ADA Programs Division Manager Christine Calabrese requested agenda modification for Item B under Staff Reports to come first.

VIII. Staff Reports

- A. ADA Self-Evaluation and Transition Plan Project Status Report, *Christine Calabrese, ADA Programs Division Manager*
- Deferred due to time constraints.
- B. Telegraph Avenue Sheltered Bikeways and Disability Access, *Christine Calabrese*
- Ms. Calabrese stated the ADA Programs Division received an ADA Grievance from an individual with a mobility disability regarding the lack of disabled parking/blue zones along Telegraph Avenue where the new sheltered bikeways have been installed.

- Using information provided by the Department of Transportation in a PowerPoint slide presentation (**Exhibit B**), Ms. Calabrese provided an overview of the Telegraph Avenue Complete Streets Project, and its initial results:
 - a. 40% decrease in collisions
 - b. Increased pedestrian traffic and retail sales
 - c. 52% of bicyclists feel safer and travel the corridor more often.
- Ms. Calabrese provided information about activities that will take place in the next phase:
 - a. Bus loading and unloading improvements
 - b. Parking improvements, including installation of blue zones/disabled parking zones on Telegraph Avenue side streets adjacent to corner curb ramps serving Telegraph Avenue, as the current Telegraph Avenue street design does not permit the installation of compliant blue zones
- Commissioner Contreras stated that blue zones to be clear of obstructions, such as bike racks and poles.
- Commissioner Harrington inquired how this will be coordinated with the Transition Plan. Ms. Calabrese stated that the City's on-street disabled parking zone/blue zone policies were last updated in 2009. The current update will use methodology used in the AC Transit Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) project, and which is being applied to this current project.
- Chair Sperling stated that he did not hear any information in the report on results of the initial phase of work regarding impacts on pedestrians or drivers

with disabilities. He suggested that the statistics on increased pedestrian traffic and retail sales are more likely attributable to the improving economy.

- Commissioner Contreras stated that the sheltered bikeway clearance is not wide enough to accommodate a wheelchair lift. She stated that she does not want to see this model replicated elsewhere in Oakland.
- Ms. Calabrese suggested further discussion take place with staff from the DOT responsible for complete streets planning and implementation at a future MCPD meeting.
- Commissioner Zisser inquired whether ADA staff had been consulted on this project. Ms. Calabrese stated that she was not consulted on the initial design but has since consulted on the current phase as a result of the ADA Grievance.
- Ian Smith inquired whether the map shown as part of the PowerPoint presentation (**Exhibit B**) is available on the City of Oakland website and the current timeline for the updated project modifications. Ms. Calabrese the public to the City's website and to search for Telegraph Avenue Complete Streets to find additional information. She explained that there is no current timeline for the modifications and that staff are still seeking input on the next phase.
- Ginger Jui, a member of the public and representing Bike East Bay, stated that her organization advocated aggressively for the initial phase of the project and is now interested in getting feedback from the MCPD and others for Phase II, which will include improvements for all users – bicyclists, pedestrians, and public transit

users. She summarized some of the planned Phase II improvements:

- a. Bus boarding islands are planned to be installed to help eliminate the bicycle and bus conflict. This will improve boarding and bus travel times.
 - b. Phase I was a paint-only project, so facilities for wheelchair ramp offloading were not installed. Since Phase I was completed, the San Francisco Metropolitan Transportation Agency (SFMTA) created a handbook for designing protected bike lane facilities that do not conflict with right of way access for pedestrians and motorists with disabilities. (**Exhibit C**). She encouraged the MCPD to read the handbook and see what it suggests for piloting on Telegraph Avenue or in other bike lane projects in Oakland.
- Commissioner Van Docto stated that other cities have implemented sheltered bike lanes. He suggested requesting data on impacts and design considerations for persons with disabilities from other cities. Furthermore, he is part of the 48% of bicyclists that feel the current Telegraph Avenue bike lanes are more dangerous.
 - Ms. Calabrese reiterated her suggestion that the MCPD devote at future meeting to discuss the City's bicycle and pedestrian master plans as well as Measure KK/I-Bond implementation.
 - Motion to accept the report: Chair Sperling
Seconded by Commissioner Harrington
Aye: 7 - Contreras, Gregory, Harrington, Sperling, Van Docto, Young, Zisser

Motion passed.

- Commissioner Zisser suggested the MCPD establish an ad hoc committee rather than setting aside time at a full MCPD meeting for bicycle and pedestrian topics. He also inquired if ad hoc committees require public noticing. Ms. Calabrese confirmed that there must be noticing.
- Commissioners Contreras and Gregory responded that they prefer all topics be addressed by the full commission either when all or most commissioners want it addressed and/or when no or few commissioners wanted to be on a committee.
- Commissioner Contreras also requested from now on that organizations working on bicycle projects must include people with disabilities in their meetings. Ms. Calabrese reminded commissioners that the City has a Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Commission (BPAC) that MCPD members may choose to attend.
- Motion to form an ad hoc committee on topics of bicycle and pedestrian master plans: Commissioner Zisser
Seconded by Commissioner Young
Aye: 2 - Young, Zisser
Nay: 5 - Contreras, Gregory, Harrington, Sperling, Van Docto

Motion not passed.

- C. Bike Share Program Accessibility Update; *Carlos Hernandez, Bike Share Coordinator, Department of Transportation*

- Mr. Hernandez has been working with Motivate, the Bike Share vendor, Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC), the Bike Share Program Regional Coordinator, and the Bay Area Outreach and Recreation Program (BORP), a local provider of adaptive cycling opportunities and equipment, to establish a one-year adaptive bike pilot and plan for analyzing what additional measures to take to make bike share accessible to persons with mobility disabilities.
 - a. From July through August of 2017, they are expected to install stations and at the same time make available a pilot program, similar to what is offered in Portland and Detroit, to connect cyclists with disabilities to a vendor (BORP) for adaptive cycle rentals.
 - b. The one-year pilot will require a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with BORP.
 - c. City of Oakland staff will lead the evaluation process, to see how this pilot responds to disability community needs.
 - d. MTC is also forming an Advisory Committee to examine and make recommendations for making bike share accessible regionally, and is inviting two to three members of the MCPD to join.
- Commissioner Gregory stated that BORP is a great program for recreation, but not for point to point transportation, which is what the bike share program is supposed to be.
- Chair Sperling agreed with Commissioner Gregory that BORP is primarily for recreation.
- Greg Milano, representing BORP, stated BORP does occasionally provide rentals for bicycle round-trips. He

stated that BORP has received calls from other cities implementing bike share. Regardless of the outcome of the pilot phase, he stated that BORP is eager to be part of the process of examining solutions for making bike share accessible to persons with disabilities.

- Commissioner Gregory reiterated his concern about viewing BORP as the solution, as it is a separate and different program than bike share.
- Sherri Rita, ADA Programmatic Access Coordinator, recommended reviewing the page of the Ford Go Bike website (the program sponsor) under Exhibit C, which directs individuals with disabilities interested in adaptive cycles to contact BORP, which seems to indicate the parties' have settled on relying on BORP to fulfill adaptive bike requests.
- Chair Sperling inquired who on the MCPD is interested in participating on the MTC Bike Share Advisory Committee.
 - a. Commissioners Sperling, Thomas, and Young volunteered, but Commissioner Young deferred to Commissioner Thomas, since they both work at the same organization.
 - b. Commissioner Contreras expressed interest as an alternate.
- Ms. Rita stated that as this is a regional committee, not Oakland-specific, commissioners should provide names of others not on the MCPD to Mr. Hernandez.
- Motion to accept the report: Commissioner Zisser
Seconded by Commissioner Gregory

Aye: 7 - Contreras, Gregory, Harrington, Sperling, Van Docto, Young, Zisser

Motion passed.

D. Proposal for Increasing Wheelchair Accessible Vehicles through the City of Oakland Taxi Program; *Gregory Minor, City Administrator's Office*

- Mr. Minor presented the draft Request for Proposals (RFP) to increase the number of on-demand wheelchair accessible vehicles (WAVs):
 - a. 11 taxi permits have been revoked for non-use and are therefore available to assign as the City deems appropriate. Given the perceived need for additional WAVs, the intent of the RFP is to make the remaining permits available exclusively to WAV operators.
 - b. As a result of the RFP, the City may be able to get additional WAVs on the road, or, establish a baseline of interest in the absence of offering incentives as discussed with stakeholders and at the previous MCPD meeting. The interest, or lack thereof in the absence of incentives, may provide the foundation for making a request for funds to support specific incentives in addition to making the remaining permits available only to WAV operators.
 - c. Commissioners Contreras and Zisser commented on the 30-minute response time as possibly too long.

- d. Commissioner Harrington inquired about the mechanism to enforce the 30-minute response time; RFP could also go a little above and beyond by asking if they can beat 30 minutes.
- e. Nikki Brown-Booker, Executive Director from Easy Does It (EDI), which is funded by Measure E in Berkeley to provide emergency and other transportation for persons with disabilities, stated that their goal is 45 minutes for response time, which they achieve about 80% of the time. Thus, 30 minutes is good enough if the company has multiple vehicles, but it would be difficult to achieve if they have only one vehicle. She stated that to be able to respond to the draft RFP, EDI would have to find funding to purchase two to four more vehicles to serve Oakland, plus insurance, workers compensation, wages, payroll tax, driver training, and maintenance. EDI would otherwise be interested in responding as it gets calls from Oakland residents every day.
- f. Commissioner Gregory inquired whether the Department of Transportation has the power to take a certain amount of money from Measure KK to be a pot of money like Berkeley Measure E for on-demand transportation for persons with disabilities. Ms. Rita responded no.
- g. Ms. Bettye Lou Wright shared as she has in previous meetings that she goes to Stockton about 10 to 14 times a year, and she always uses the Dial-A-Ride program, which uses

approximately eight mini-vans. They have a 20-minute window. Never in seven years has she had a negative moment. One time, a mini-van broke down, and they called her to tell her they were acquiring another mini-van. She only had to wait an extra 10 minutes.

- h. Commissioner Gregory stated that Dial-A-Ride is another name for paratransit service. Thus, the \$3 per ride service in Stockton run by San Joaquin Regional Transit District is clearly paratransit service that seems superior to East Bay Paratransit. Furthermore, EDI in Berkeley is proof that paratransit can also provide good service.
- i. Ian Smith, member of the public, encouraged better agenda discipline to stay on topic. The topic on the agenda is on-demand transportation, not paratransit. He also expressed the need for publicity of the need for WAVs in Oakland. As that RFP goes out, it needs to be loudly communicated to potential respondents that there is indeed a need for WAVs in Oakland. Mr. Smith also reminded the group that there is no publicly available online information regarding taxi permits at this time, and stated the need to make such information readily available once the City brings the WAVs on board.
- j. Motion to accept the report: Commissioner Gregory
Seconded by Commissioner Harrington

Aye: 7 - Contreras, Gregory, Harrington,
Sperling, Van Docto, Young, Zisser
Motion passed.

IX. New Business

- Deferred due to time constraints.

X. Old Business

A. Recommendation by the Ad-hoc Committee on establishing
Standing Committees

- Deferred due to time constraints.

XI. Adjourn 8:10pm