



**PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION
(PRAC)**

City of Oakland

**Wednesday, October 14, 2015 – 4:30pm
Lake Merritt Garden, 666 Bellevue Avenue**

Minutes

1. CALL TO ORDER: 4:35pm

2. ROLL CALL:

**BELCHER, CORBIN, DU BOIS, KADERA-REDMOND, MANNING, MARSHALL,
MILLER, PETERSON, ROSENBLOOM, SELNA, WU**

Present: Corbin, Dubois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Miller, Rosenbloom

Arrivals: Marshall and Wu (4:39)

Excused: Belcher, Peterson and Selna

Staff: Parks and Recreation – Audree V. Jones-Taylor, Diane Boyd, Zermaine Thomas, Gail McMillon, Michelle Doppelt; Planning and Building – Alicia Parker; Bureau of Planning-Catherine Payne

Excused: Belcher, Peterson, Selna

3. DISPOSITION OF MINUTES:

- May 13, 2015 Draft Meeting Minutes
- July 8, 2015 Draft Meeting Minutes
- September 16, 2015 Draft Meeting Minutes

Note: These items will be voted on at the next meeting as there were insufficient members present to approve the May, July or September draft minutes.

4. SPECIAL ORDERS:

5. PRAC PENDING LIST:

6. MODIFICATIONS TO THE AGENDA:

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to modify the agenda and move Item 8K before Item 8J. **Moved by:** Du Bois Commissioner **Second by:** Commissioner Kadera-Redmond. **Vote:**

Yes – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu

Motion: Passed.

Note: The Friends of Sausal Creek requested that Item 8D be pulled until further notice.

7. CONSENT NEW BUSINESS:

8. NEW BUSINESS

A. INFORMATIONAL REPORT ON THE DOWNTOWN OAKLAND SPECIFIC PLAN

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8A presented by Alicia Parker from the Planning and Building Department. The City's Planning and Building Department will launch *Plan Downtown*, a two year planning process to develop a community-driven vision for the future of Downtown. The project team will host a week-long pop-up open house and design charrette at 1544 Broadway, the future home of SPUR Oakland, from October 20 to 27. Drop by anytime between 9am and 6pm (8pm on Tuesday and Thursday). A charrette is a combination of on-location planning, design studio and town meetings and is the centerpiece of the public participation process and focuses broad community input over a short period of time through hands-on participation. During the course of the charrette, the consultant team will lead a series of public meetings, design sessions, stakeholder interviews and technical meetings in order to quickly engage the community and form the framework for the Specific Plan.

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to accept the information report on the Downtown Oakland Specific Plan. **Moved by:** Commissioner Kadera-Redmond **Second by:** Commissioner Manning. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu
Motion: Passed.

B. REQUEST FROM WEST OAKLAND ENVIRONMENTAL INDICATORS PROJECT, FOR PERMISSION TO COLLECT FUNDS ON-SITE TO INCLUDE DOOR TICKET SALES, DONATIONS, SILENT AUCTION, RAFFLES AND CASH BAR AT THEIR 7TH ANNUAL FUNDRAISER AND CELEBRATION OF ACCOMPLISHMENTS ALONG WITH MS. GORDON'S 70TH BIRTHDAY AT THE LAKE MERRITT SAILBOAT HOUSE ON FRIDAY, DECEMBER 11, 2015.

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8B prepared by Zermaine Thomas. This is the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project first year hosting their fundraising event at the Lake Merritt Sailboat House.

The West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project is a community based environmental justice organization whose focus is on improving the wellbeing, employment, homes and neighborhoods of West Oakland residents through participatory research projects, community empowerment and collaborative problem solving techniques. This is the organization's first presentation to the PRAC.

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project organizers permission to collect funds for on-site ticket sales, donations, silent auction raffle and cash bar the their 7th Annual Fundraiser at the Lake Merritt Sailboat House on Friday, December 11, 2015. **Moved by:** Commissioner Wu **Second by:** Commissioner Rosenbloom. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu **Motion:** Passed.

C. **REQUEST FROM CROHN'S & COLITIS FOUNDATION OF AMERICA (CCFA) FOR PERMISSION TO HOST A FUNDRAISING WALK; TAKE STEPS OAKLAND WALK 2015 BY ACCEPTING ON-SITE DONATION AND SPONSORSHIPS AT LAKESIDE PARK (BANDSTAND) ON SUNDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2015.**

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8C prepared by Zermaine Thomas. The Take Steps Oakland Walk fundraiser will support research efforts to find a cure for Inflammatory Bowl Disease (IBD) suffered by approximately 75,000 Northern Californians, including children and adults. This is the first request and presentation made to the Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission by the Crohn's and Colitis Foundation.

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant the Crohn's and Colitis Foundation permission the host their Take Steps Oakland Walk and Fundraiser at the Lakeside Park Bandstand on Sunday, November 8, 2015. **Moved by:** Commissioner Du Bois **Second by:** Commissioner Manning. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu **Motion:**

D. **REQUEST FOR THE PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION TO APPROVE THE PROPOSED WETLANDS AT FRIENDS OF SAUSAL CREEK (FOSC) NATIVE PLANT NURSERY IN JOAQUIN MILLER PARK.**

The Friends of Sausal Creek (FOSC) proposes to create two naturally appearing and functioning ephemeral (vernal pond) wetland areas inside the FOSC Native Plant Nursery in Joaquin Miller Park. The wetlands will create ecologically valuable and locally-rare wildlife habitat, increase pollinator habitat, and improve wildlife viewing opportunities—providing excellent opportunities for outdoor education with nursery volunteers and local school children visiting the nursery on field trips.

Note: The Friends of Sausal Creek requested that Item 8D be pulled until further notice.

E. **REQUESTING APPROVAL FROM THE PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION TO ALLOW MONTERA MIDDLE SCHOOL PTO TO COLLECT ENTRY FEES, HOST SILENT AND LIVE AUCTION, ACCEPT DONATIONS, AND TO SELL FOOD, BEVERAGES AND ALCOHOLIC DRINKS AT THEIR 1ST AUCTION FUNDRAISER TO BE HELD AT THE JOAQUIN MILLER COMMUNITY CENTER ON SATURDAY, NOVEMBER 7, 2015.**

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8E prepared by Zermaine Thomas. All proceeds from the fundraiser will support the Montera Middle School after school programs, including woodshops, the library and music.

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant the Montera Middle School PTO permission to; collect entry fees and donations, sell food, alcoholic beverages and host a live auction at their fundraising event at the Joaquin Miller Community Center on Saturday, November 7, 2015. **Moved by:** Commissioner Manning. **Second by:** Commissioner Wu. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu **Motion:** Passed

F. REQUEST FOR APPROVAL TO DEDICATE A BENCH TO ARLENE DOPPELT.

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8F presented by Michelle Doppelt from Oakland Parks and Recreation. Ms. Michelle Doppelt and family requested that a bench be dedicated to honor their mother, sister, wife and aunt, Arlene Doppelt. The desired bench location is in the new Lake Merritt Sailboat House parking area. The specific bench faces the lake and is one of the newly existing metal benches that are along the pathway between the Sailboat house and the Jr. Science Center. The plaque installation process is in accordance with the Public Works Agency construction requirements. Ms. Doppelt and family will make a donation in the amount of \$600.00 to the Oakland Parks and Recreation Foundation for the purchase and installation of the plaque. The dedication plaque will read:

**In loving memory of Arlene Belling Shapiro Doppelt
Oakland born lover of the animals of Lake Merritt
March 24, 1936- February 12, 2015**

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant Ms. Michelle Doppelt and family permission to dedicate a bench to Arlene Doppelt. The bench is located in the new Lake Merritt Sailboat House parking area and will read as recorded above. **Moved by:** Commissioner Wu **Second by:** Commissioner Kadera-Redmond. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu **Motion:** Passed

G. REQUEST FOR APPROVAL TO DEDICATE A BENCH TO ANTOINETTE ANDERSON.

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8G presented by Michelle Doppelt from Oakland Parks and Recreation. Ms. Helen Anderson and family requested to have a bench dedicated to her daughter, Antoinette Anderson. They would like a bench on the Bellevue side of the lake, adjacent to the Rotary Nature Center and children's playground, facing the bird sanctuary in the lake. Ms. Anderson would prefer a wooden bench and is willing to refurbish one in that location, most of which are quite old and not in the best condition. Ms. Anderson and family will make a donation of \$600 to the Oakland Parks and Recreation Foundation for the purchase and installation of the plaque. The dedication plaque should read:

**Antoinette Anderson
Nov. 20, 1970 – Aug. 12, 2012
Free to fly**

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant Ms. Anderson and family permission to dedicate a bench to Antoinette Anderson. The bench is located on the Bellevue side of Lake Merritt, adjacent to the Rotary Nature Center and children's playground facing the bird sanctuary and will read as recorded above. **Moved by:** Commissioner Du Bois **Second by:** Commissioner Marshall. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu **Motion:** Passed

H. **REQUEST FOR APPROVAL TO DEDICATE A BENCH TO STEPHEN CLARK BROWN.**

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8H presented by Michelle Doppelt from Oakland Parks and Recreation. Ms. Linda Brown and family requested that a bench be dedicated to honor her husband Stephen Clark Brown. The desired bench is located in the Lake Merritt Sailboat House parking area. The specific bench is one of the newly installed metal ones situated along the pathway between the Sailboat House and the Jr. Science Center and faces the lake. The plaque installation process is in accordance with the Public Works Agency construction requirements. Ms. Brown and family will make a donation in the amount of \$600.00 to the Oakland Parks and Recreation Foundation for the purchase and installation of the plaque. The dedication plaque will read:

**In loving memory of Stephen Clark Brown
He celebrated Oakland and its people.
October 1947 - December 2014**

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant Ms. Brown and family permission to dedicate a bench to Stephen Clark Brown. The bench is located in the Lake Merritt Sailboat House parking area. The specific bench is one of the newly installed metal ones situated along the pathway between the Sailboat House and the Jr. Science Center and faces the lake and will read as recorded above.

Moved by: Commissioner Manning **Second by:** Commissioner Wu. **Vote:** Yes – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu **Motion:** Passed

I. **REQUEST FOR APPROVAL TO DEDICATE A BENCH TO TED BRESNAHAN**

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8I presented by Michelle Doppelt from Oakland Parks and Recreation. Ms. Linda Franz and family requested that a new wood bench be installed and dedicated to honor her long-time companion and family member Ted Bresnahan, who passed away earlier this year. The desired bench location is in Dimond Park. The specific bench would face the lawn area of the Dimond Park BBQ area and will be installed under the tree just below the top pathway. The bench and plaque installation process is in accordance with the Public Works Agency construction requirements. Ms. Franz and family will make a donation in the amount of \$800.00 to the Oakland Parks and Recreation Foundation for the purchase and installation of the wood bench and plaque. The dedication plaque will read:

**In Loving Memory
Ted Bresnahan
Poet and Philosopher**

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant Ms. Franz and family permission to install and dedicate a bench to Ted Bresnahan to be located in Dimond Park facing the lawn and barbeque areas under the tree just below the top pathway. The dedication plaque will read as recorded above.

Moved by: Commissioner Rosenbloom **Second by:** Commissioner Kadera-Redmond. **Vote:** Yes – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu
Motion: Passed

J. **RECOMMENDATION REPORT REGARDING FINAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT APPLICATION FOR SHORELINE PARK (BROOKLYN BASIN)**

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission (PRAC) reviewed the staff report for Item 8J presented by Catherine Payne from Bureau of Planning . The purpose of this report was to seek a recommendation from the Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission (PRAC) regarding a Final Development Permit (FDP) application for Shoreline Park. The PRAC previously reviewed a preliminary design for Shoreline Park at their regularly scheduled meeting on April 8, 2015. At this time, the applicant, Zarsion-OHP 1, LLC (ZOHP) has submitted revised plans and seeks approval of the FDP by the Planning Commission. As part of the review process, Bureau of Planning staff requests that the PRAC conduct design review and make a recommendation the Planning Commission. The proposed Final Development Permit is to construct Shoreline Park, including the demolition of a large portion of the 9th Avenue Terminal, as approved under the Preliminary Development Permit. The Applicant seeks the Shoreline Park FDP in compliance with the Brooklyn Basin project conditions of approval requiring delivery of the park improvements prior to delivery of the 550th dwelling unit for Phase I.

Shoreline Park is one of three new parks included in the Brooklyn Basin redesign project. The site for Shoreline Park sits on approximately 10 acres near the Oakland Estuary and 9th Avenue. Past uses of the site included retail, commercial and industrial facilities, container storage and the Ninth Avenue Terminal. Preservation of the southeastern section of the Ninth Street Terminal with approximately 90% of the facility slated for demolition is included in the approved design plans. General design elements and amenities include: open spaces for passive use and planned events; connecting pathways to other parts of the greater parkland; off street parking; access to the Bay Trail; public art; raised planted areas including drought resistant shrubs and trees.

A Power Point presentation and overview of the Shoreline Park Design Plan for the Brooklyn Basin was provided. Staff and the project applicant fielded questions for the Commission.

Public Comments:

- The project site is vast and empty. This is the first major parks project in decades; it is important to make changes now and not after its completion. In its current state, the 9th Avenue Terminal serves as a wind break which will be lost after demolition. Designs should reflect shaded and wind break features as well as a launch site for boats, canoes and kayaks. Restrooms will be needed throughout the park; current plans only reflect inclusion near the site of proposed restaurant areas. Parks programming management is needed.

- Due to possible contamination and splintering, reuse of the 9th Avenue Terminal wood for decking is not advisable. A greater disbursement and variety of vegetation is needed in the design plans. The project developer should retain management of the park in perpetuity.
- More restrooms, parking and public transportation will be needed to accommodate large events. Human activity will disturb nearby wildlife and migrating birds habitat. Developer should work with the California Native Plant Society and California Fish and Game.

PRAC Comments:

Manning: Trash and cigarette pollution entering the estuary and bay are of great concern. Trash control measures are needed. Educational kiosks are also needed to inform the public regarding rising sea level issues. It was requested that the Planning Commission delay their vote and return the project back to PRAC for continued review and consideration.

DuBois: More of the 9th Street Terminal should be retained; additional restrooms and vegetation are needed throughout the project. PRAC comments should consolidate its comments in a “white paper” and forward to the Planning Commission. Troubled that PRAC is faced with the last opportunity to review and make comments - the process is moving too fast.

Rosenbloom: Would like PRAC members serve on any future Design Review subcommittee.

Shoreline Parks should serve both local and regional communities.

Kadera-Redmond: Access to the water is needed for all to enjoy. Developers were encouraged to consider public art; incorporating Manzanita trees to facilitate visibility and changeable way-finding signs should to accommodate programs and large events in the park. Also recommends committing the developer to park programming.

Corbin: Shoreline Park is an expansive open space – the starkness may keep potential visitors away. Recommends consideration be given to the roof top garden sustainable design concept by incorporating living wall structures and living sculptures created by using drought resistant plants. Living wall structures can be used as wind barriers.

Wu: Shoreline Park should appeal to all Oakland residents as a destination spot. Project depictions lack diversity and give the feeling of gentrification.

Chair Miller: The project design depicts an immense area. More public art is needed – recommends thought be given to the Uptown Temporary Art Park. Contemplate giving PRAC further non-discretionary review of the project.

Vote 1 of 2:

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve staff recommendation to:

- A. Find that the Shoreline Park Final Development Plan is in substantial conformance with the Preliminary Development Plan (included in Attachment B to this report);
- B. Find that the Shoreline Park Final Development Plan meets the attached Oakland Municipal Code Chapter 17.136.050 - Regular design review criteria (see Attachment C to this report).

Moved by: Commissioner Wu **Second by:** Commissioner Manning. **Vote – Yes:**

Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu. **Abstained** - Corbin, DuBois and Marshall. **Motion:** Failed

Corbin: What constitutes substantial? Shoreline Park will be a new City park for the people of Oakland, but the PRAC has a very small role to play in how the project unfolds over the unforeseeable future.

Du Bois: Does not mean to delay or prevent the project from occurring, but wants to have more impact and feedback. The purpose for following up on the word “substantial” is to determine if it is properly used in this type of document.

Staff: the language regarding the term “substantial” comes the Planning Code of the Oakland Municipal Code.

Manning: Requests that follow commissioners support Recommendations A and B.

Marshall: Would like motion to reflect A yes or no vote on Recommendations A, B and C.

Vote 2 of 2:

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to

- A. Find that the Shoreline Park Final Development Plan is in substantial conformance with the Preliminary Development Plan;
- B. Find that the Shoreline Park Final Development Plan meets the Oakland Municipal Code chapter 17.136.050-Regular design review criteria and;
- C. Request the Planning Commission to delay a decision regarding the Shoreline Park Final Development Permit application in order for the PRAC to provide additional input and remain engaged as the process moves forward, regarding the following concerns:
 - o Assurance that the proposed design includes features to reduce the potential for water pollution from trash (including tobacco);
 - o Inclusive design, so that the park feels like a welcoming space for Oakland residents, of all income groups and cultural backgrounds;
 - o Green design, such as green walls and green roofs;
 - o Interpretive elements to address sea-level rise;
 - o Additional moveable furniture;
 - o Continuity of park programming;
 - o Provision of children’s play areas (potentially within the development itself and not necessarily in the Shoreline Park);
 - o Universal water access;
 - o Wayfinding signage

- A substantial increase in the amount of public art, potentially including art in the water;
- Adequate provision of restrooms;
- Adequate shade devices;
- More imaginative design and features; and
- Addressing public comments submitted to the PRAC following publication of the staff report; and

Request the Planning Commission to include PRAC representation on a DRC subcommittee to conduct further design review and reporting, should the project be approved with a DRC subcommittee.

Moved by: Commissioner Manning **Second by:** Commissioner Wu. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu. **No** – Marshall.

Motion: Passed.

K. Request for Approval to Dedicate a Bench to Andrea Snedeker

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for Item 8K presented by Michelle Doppelt from Oakland Parks and Recreation. Mr. Philippos Tsourkas requested that a bench facing the children’s play area in Mosswood Park be dedicated to honor Andrea Snedeker. Mr. Tsourkas will make a donation of \$800.00 to the Oakland Parks and Recreation Foundation to have the bench cleaned-up and for the purchase and installation of the plaque. The dedication plaque will read:

**In loving memory of
Andrea Snedeker
Aug. 7, 1965 - Dec. 5, 2013
Beloved fiancée
Neighborhood resident**

Motion: Commissioner Miller entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendation to grant Mr. Philippos Tsouorkas permission to dedicate a bench to Andrea Snedeker. The bench is located in Mosswood Park facing the children’s play area. The dedication plaque will read as recorded above. **Moved by:** Commissioner Manning. **Second by:** Commissioner Rosenbloom. **Vote: Yes** – Corbin, Du Bois, Kadera-Redmond, Manning, Marshall, Miller, Rosenbloom, and Wu **Motion:** Passed

Chair Miller recommended that future bench dedications be placed on the consent calendar barring unusual circumstances.

9. COMMUNICATIONS:

10. PRAC COMMITTEE REPORT:

11. ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORTS:

12. UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

13. COUNCIL REFERRALS:

14. OPEN FORUM:

Tora Rocha – Announced the Autumn Lights Festival October 16th and 17th from 6pm to 9pm.

Introduction on new commissioners:

- C.N.E. Corbin – 4th year Ph.D. student at the University of Berkeley Environmental Sciences Policies and Management Department
- Cyril Manning – Communications Director for Save the Bay

15. DIRECTOR'S REPORT:

A. Signs at Lake Merritt

- Music at Lake Merritt becoming an issue – clashes between new and previously existing community members.
- Ordinance to be reviewed and updated.
- Request PRAC to form a task force to work with staff, review ordinances related to parks. With special attention on those that are obsolete.
- Distributed Ordinances and Oakland Municipal Codes

PRAC Ordinance Taskforce volunteers:

Marshall

Kadera-Redmond

Corbin

Staff – Gail McMillon

B. Next PRAC Meetings

- Veterans Day 11/11
- Special PRAC Meeting 11/4 – Signage Ordinances and Gift in Place
- Special PRAC Meeting 11/18

16. ADJOURNMENT: 7:44pm

Respectfully submitted,

Audree V. Jones-Taylor
Secretary

Diane Boyd
Recording Secretary

This meeting is wheelchair accessible. To request materials in alternative formats, or to request an ASL interpreter, or assistive listening device, please call ***Oakland Parks and Recreation at (510) 238-7532*** or **TDD (510) 615-5883** at least three working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting so attendees who may experience chemical sensitivities may attend. Thank you.

This meeting is wheelchair accessible. To request materials in alternative formats, or to request an ASL interpreter, or assistive listening device, please call ***Oakland Parks and Recreation at (510) 238-7532*** or **TDD (510) 615-5883** at least three working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting so attendees who may experience chemical sensitivities may attend. Thank you.

Next Meeting :

Special Meetings

Wednesday, November 4, 4:30pm and

Wednesday, November 18, 4:30 p.m.

Lakeside Garden Center

666 Bellevue Ave, Oakland, CA